

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Minutes

September 26, 2024

2:15 P.M. @ Training and Safety Center

| Attendees | Present | Arrived Late | Left Early | Absent | |
|--|----------------|---------------------|-------------------|---------------|--|
| Carol Kramer, Commissioner, Chair | X | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown, Commissioner | | X | | | |
| Orlando Rivera, Commissioner | X | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky, Commissioner | | | | X | |
| Zahira Jimenez, Commissioner | X | | | | |
| Dr. Rose Nichols, Executive Secretary | X | | | | |
| Time Meeting Began: 2:20 PM | | | | | |
| | | | | | |

I. Approval of the Minutes of the meeting on August 22, 2024

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | X | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

II. Approval of the Minutes of the meeting on September 19, 2024. **Special Meeting

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | X | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | X | | |

III. Commission Correspondence(s): NONE

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | | | | |

IV. Classification/Reclassification(s):

| | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| Administration/Mayor's Office | Executive Staff Assistant I Br. 18 (\$52,618 - \$68,674) |
|-------------------------------|---|

| | |
|---|---|
| Classify (1) | Exempt |
| ECD/911Call Center Classify (1) | Manager of ECD Administration Br. 29 (\$85,769 - \$113,087) Competitive |
| DES/Water Classify (1) | Water Plant Operator Br. 16 (\$49,412 - \$63,424) Competitive |
| DES/Equipment Services Classify (1) | Automotive Aide/Temporary (Temporary 1 Year) Br. 58 (\$19.28 - \$23.98) Non-Competitive |
| RPL/Community Branch Classify (1) | Library Assistant/Bilingual Br 14 (\$46,320 - \$59,495) Competitive) |
| FIN/RTVA Classify (1) | Lead Motor Vehicle/Temporary (Temporary 3 months) Br. 12 (\$43,590- \$55,874) Competitive |
| DRHS/ Commissioner's Office Classify (2) | Shelter Veterinarian/Part-Time Br. 288 (\$82,412 - \$108,663) Competitive |
| DRHS/Commissioner's Office Classify (2) | Animal Care Technician/Part-Time/Temporary (11 Months) Br. 10 (\$41,235 - \$52,364) Non-Competitive |
| DRHS/Recreation & Youth Services Classify (2) | Youth Worker/Part-Time Br. 353 (\$15.25) Labor |
| IT/Network Services Classify (1) | Computer Communications Technician Br. 21 (\$58,335 - \$77,445) Competitive |
| RFD/Administration Classify (1) | Fire Lieutenant/Temporary (3Months) Br. 82 (\$101,231 - \$106,237) Competitive |
| IT/Data and Digital Services Classify (1) | Application Services Developer I Br. 23 (\$66,773 - \$88,043) Competitive |

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | X | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

V. Adoption of Job Specification(s):

- Assistant Operations Superintendent
- Shelter Veterinarian

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | X | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | X | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|----------------|--|--|---|--|--|
| Zahira Jimenez | | | X | | |
|----------------|--|--|---|--|--|

VI. Establishment of Civil Service Eligible List(s): *included Addenda items*

- 911 Dispatcher II, 24ELP2404
- Cemetery Manager, 24EOC85961
- Cemetery Operations Supervisor, 24EP72711
- Cemetery Operations Supervisor, 24EOC85956
- Human Resource Consultant I, 24EOC87140
- Human Resource Consultant II, 24EP72624
- Lead Paint Program Coordinator, 24EOC86864
- Library Assistant, 24EOC89305
- Library Assistant/Bilingual, 24EOC89306
- Parks Operations Supervisor, 24EP72714
- Parks Operations Supervisor, 24EOC85962
- Project Assistant, 24EOC86256
- Senior Human Resource Consultant, 24EP74021
- Senior Human Resource Consultant, 24EOC86964

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | X | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

• **Close-out of examination process: ADD ADDENDA ITEMS**

- Building Maintenance Foreman, 24EOC86835
- Building Maintenance Foreman, 24EP72670
- Human Resource Consultant I/Bilingual, 24EOC75263
- Human Resource Consultant II/Bilingual, 24EP75276
- Project Assistant/Bilingual, 24EP74476
- Project Assistant/Bilingual, 24EOC86261
- Project Assistant, 24EP74440

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | X | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | X | | |

VII. Request for Extension of Civil Service Eligible Lists(s):

- Associate Library Director, 23EOC61769
- Fire Captain, 23EP78038
- Fire Lieutenant, 23EP75947
- Police Captain, 23ELP2308
- Supervisor of Administrative Services, 22EOC63931

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|--------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
|--------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|

| | | | | | |
|-----------------------|---|---|---|--|--|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | X | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | X | | |

VIII. Request for Extension of Temporary Position(s): NONE

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | | | | |

IX. Transfer(s): NONE

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | | | | |

X. Reinstatement Request(s): NONE

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | | | | |

XI. Misc.: NONE

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | | | | |

XII. Executive Session

| Attendees | Present | Arrived Late | Left Early | Absent | |
|--------------------------------------|---------|--------------|------------|--------|--|
| Carol Kramer, Commissioner, Chair | X | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|---------------------------------------|---|--|--|---|--|
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown, Commissioner | X | | | | |
| Orlando Rivera, Commissioner | X | | | | |
| Edward Stulginsky, Commissioner | | | | X | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | | | |
| Dr. Rose Nichols, Executive Secretary | X | | | | |

Move to Executive Session - Time Began: 2:45 pm

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | X | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | X | | |

- Rochester Police Department is recommending disqualifications of prospective Police Officer candidates

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | X | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

- Render the final decisions of the Police Officer Candidate's appeals

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | X | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

Moved Out of Executive Session - Time Ended: 2:52 PM

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2 nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------------|-------|-----|---------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | X | | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | | X | X | | |

Chair announced decisions made in Executive Session

- Unanimous decision to uphold all of the recommended disqualifications
- Unanimous decision to uphold the disqualifications for those candidates who appealed during the two days of appeal hearings.

Moved to end Civil Service Commission

| Commissioner | Motioned | 2nd | Agree | Nay | Abstain |
|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------|----------------|
| Carol Kramer | | | X | | |
| Tashanda Thomas-Brown | | | X | | |
| Orlando Rivera | | X | X | | |
| Edward Stulginsky | | | | | |
| Zahira Jimenez | X | | X | | |

THE END 2:53 pm