

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
EMPLOYEE HIRING PROCESS REVIEW

Distribution: Lovely Warren, Mayor
Dr. Cedric Alexander, Deputy Mayor
Tassie R. Demps, Director/BHRM
Tim Curtin, Corporation Counsel

Office of Public Integrity
Date: December 6, 2018

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In this review, the Office of Public Integrity (OPI) examined the City's Department of Human Resources Management's (DHRM) compliance with policies and procedures for the hiring of employees. The results of this review indicate that, in general, DHRM staff are complying with the policies and procedures for employee hires.

II. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE

A. Assignment

The Office of Public Integrity routinely reviews policy and procedure compliance of City departments.

B. Background

The City of Rochester employs about 3,500 people in several hundred occupations with the focus of providing outstanding customer service. Job applications are reviewed to identify candidates who match or exceed the minimum qualifications. Applications of qualified candidates are sent to the department where the vacancy exists. The selected candidate will schedule a pre-employment drug test and any medical evaluations necessary for the job. A criminal conviction history search is completed as well as a driver's license and City residency verification as appropriate. An offer letter for employment is prepared and a notice is sent to other candidates to inform them that the position has been filled.

If a job listing states that "the individual selected will be given a provisional appointment", this means that the job is competitive and cannot be filled permanently until a civil service examination is given. The person who is selected from the current recruitment to fill this job is given an opportunity to participate in an examination for this title in the future. To retain the position, a person will be required to pass the exam and be among the three highest ranking eligible candidates on the eligibility list willing to accept the position.

Continuous recruitment advertisements are positions for which the City accepts applications daily. There is no deadline date for submitting an application. Applications are filed upon receipt. When a department notifies the Department of Human Resource Management that they wish to fill a continuous recruitment position, all applications on file for the title are reviewed to identify candidates who meet the minimum qualifications.

Applications for qualified candidates are sent to the department where the vacancy exists. The selected candidate will schedule a pre-employment drug test and any medical evaluations necessary for the job. A criminal conviction history search is completed as well as a driver's license and City residency verification as appropriate. An offer letter for employment is prepared for the selected candidate.

C. Objective and Scope

The objectives of this review were to assess the adequacy of the City of Rochester's employee hiring process and to determine compliance with policies and procedures for hires. The scope included all full-time and part-time hires with the City from July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2017.

The City of Rochester hired a total of 728 individuals for competitive, non-competitive and labor class positions within this period. The following table details the breakdown of these hires by department.

City of Rochester Employee Hires
July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2017

City Council & Clerk's Office	3
Mayor's Office	7
Law Department	5
Department of Human Resource Management	7
Emergency Communications Department	34
Rochester Fire Department	47
Department of Environmental Services	191
Rochester Public Library	85
Department of Information Technology	17
Dept. Of Neighborhood & Business Development	8
Department of Finance	7
Department of Recreation & Youth Services	241
Rochester Police Department	<u>76</u>
Total Number of Hires	<u>728</u>

Management is responsible for establishing and maintaining a system of internal accounting and administrative control. Fulfilling this responsibility requires estimates and judgments by management to assess the expected benefits and related costs of control procedures. The objectives of a system are to provide management with reasonable, but not absolute, assurance that assets are safeguarded against loss from unauthorized

use or disposition, and that transactions are executed in accordance with management's authorization and recorded properly to permit the preparation of accurate, informative reports that are fairly stated.

Because of inherent limitations in any system of internal accounting and administrative control, errors or irregularities may nevertheless occur and not be detected. Also, projection of any system evaluation to future periods is subject to the risk that procedures may become inadequate because of changes in conditions or that the degree of compliance with procedures may deteriorate.

We conducted this audit in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards (GAGAS) and the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

III. RESULTS OF REVIEW

Of the 728 employee hires during the scope period, OPI randomly selected 149 for detailed testing. The following is a summary of hires by department selected for detailed testing:

Review of Employee Hires with the City
Hires Selected for Detailed Testing by Department

Department	Competitive Hires	Non-Competitive Hires	Competitive & Non-Competitive Hires
Department of Environmental Services	3	35	38
Department of Human Resources Management	0	3	3
Department of Recreation & Youth Services	1	48	49
Emergency Communications Department	7	0	7
Department of Finance	0	1	1
Department of Information Technology	3	0	3
Law Department	1	1	2
Rochester Public Library	0	17	17
Mayor's Office	0	2	2
Department of Neighborhood & Business Development	1	1	2
Rochester Fire Department	9	1	10
Rochester Police Department	<u>10</u>	<u>5</u>	<u>15</u>
Hires Selected for Detailed Testing	<u>35</u>	<u>114</u>	<u>149</u>

OPI noted that for all 149 employee hires, DHRM possessed pre-employment drug test results and performed criminal conviction history searches without exception. Furthermore, DHRM staff verified the possession of a valid driver's licenses and City residency for those positions where it is required.

Competitive class positions require a Civil Service Examination for which successful candidates are placed in rank order on a City of Rochester Eligible List. Of the 35 competitive class employee hires that occurred during the test period, we noted that 29 were selected from a City of Rochester Eligible List, 4 were provisional hires who have not yet been placed on an Eligible List and two were retired employees who were rehired on an on-call basis and not required to be selected from a City of Rochester Eligible List.

Of the 114 non-competitive class hires that occurred during the test period, 49 were hired as seasonal employees. Seasonal employees may work up to a maximum of eight months within a twelve month period. OPI verified that all 49 seasonal employees did not exceed eight months of employment within a twelve month period.

The results of this test work indicate that, in general, internal controls over the City's employee hiring process are adequate. We noted that Department of Human Resource Management staff performed all tasks of the hiring process in accordance with City policy without exception. The Department of Human Resource Management should continue to ensure that all steps of the hiring process are conducted in accordance with City policy.

IV. DEPARTMENTAL RESPONSE

The response of the Department of Human Resource Management to this report begins on the next page.

Cole, Deborah A.

From: Cole, Deborah A.
Sent: Tuesday, December 04, 2018 11:58 AM
Subject: Response to DHRM Employee Hiring Process Review



From: Demps, Tassie R.
Sent: Tuesday, December 04, 2018 11:02 AM
To: Weir, Timothy <Timothy.Weir@CityofRochester.Gov>; Cole, Deborah A. <Debbie.Cole@CityofRochester.Gov>
Cc: Santiago, Zaida <Zaida.Santiago@CityofRochester.Gov>
Subject: FW: Response to DHRM Employee Hiring Process Review

Tim,

October 3, 2018 DHRM and OPI reviewed a draft copy of OPI's report regarding the Department of Human Resource Management (DHRM) Employee Hiring Process.

As a result of the audit it was indicate that DHRM staff complies with the policies and procedures for employee hiring. DHRM is in agreement with the results of this review.

Thank you for the oppportunity to ensure DHRM hiring practices are meeting appropriate protocols.

Tassie



Tassie Demps, EMBA
Director of Human Resource Management
City of Rochester
City Hall - Room 103-A
30 Church Street
Rochester, NY 14614
[*dempst@CityofRochester.gov*](mailto:dempst@CityofRochester.gov)

-- Confidentiality Notice -- This email message, including all the attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and contains confidential information. Unauthorized use or disclosure is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not use, disclose, copy or disseminate this information. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender immediately by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message, including attachments.