

Redevelopment of Targeted Sites – Site #5: City of Rochester, Vacuum Oil BOA

September 2017

Prepared for:

Bergmann Associates and the City of Rochester



120 West Avenue, Suite 303
Saratoga Springs, NY 12866

518.899.2608

www.camoinassociates.com

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Introduction	2
Housing Market Overview	2
Market-Feasible Housing	4
Redevelopment of Site #5	10

Executive Summary

Introduction

Camoin Associates has been working with Bergmann Associates and the City of Rochester to provide market-based research to support the redevelopment of the Vacuum Oil Brownfield Opportunity Area (BOA).

Redevelopment of Site #5

Camoin Associates reviewed Site #5 on the Vacuum Oil Brownfield Opportunity Area 2035 Vision Plan and considered two primary alternatives, including one with the Rochester Housing Authority acting as the sole redeveloper of the site and another with an assumption that the site transitions to the private sector and the units become market-rate housing. Additionally, Camoin Associates considered alternative development concepts that might be a good fit for the area.

Findings

Redevelopment of Site #5

With recently developed Riverview Apartments adjacent to the Luther Circle properties, it would be a good time to begin to upgrade the Rochester Housing Authority (RHA) properties and make improvements. The method for making these improvements could either be done by the RHA or through the transfer of the properties to a private entity for development of market rate units. Whether this transfer is possible would require open and regular communication with the RHA to identify their interest and ability to make changes and the best route forward for the neighborhood.

Additionally, Camoin Associates considered another approach which is with an organization like Housing Visions, that builds and manages properties for low to moderate income individuals throughout New York State. This type of organization could help revitalize the neighborhood with updated units but still make them accessible to current Luther Circle residents.

In order to move forward with redevelopment of this site, Camoin Associates recommends continuing the discussion with the Rochester Housing Authority to understand their goals and objectives for the properties.

Introduction

Camoin Associates has been working with Bergmann Associates and the City of Rochester to provide market based research to support the redevelopment of the Vacuum Oil Brownfield Opportunity Area (BOA). The following analysis includes a review of the housing market as well as recommendations for Site #5. Note that the housing market analysis is referred to as part of the analysis for Site #14 and the Waterfront Grouping circled below.



The analysis provided for each of the three targeted sites has been defined to meet the needs of the city and provide guidance as to best next steps, how to be successful, and potential opportunities.

Housing Market Overview

To provide context for the redevelopment scenarios, select demographic and socioeconomic data as well as general housing market information from the *Housing Analysis* are reviewed here. In that report, three geographies – the Vacuum Oil BOA, the Southwest Planning District and the City of Rochester were studied.

Sociodemographic Highlights

- 2016 Median Household Income (MHI) in the Vacuum Oil BOA was \$18,539, \$12,451 dollars lower than that of the City of Rochester (\$30,990). The SW Planning District MHI of \$29,099 was much closer to the average

for the city. While a very modest increase (by \$601, or 3.2%) in MHI is projected for the BOA, it is still expected to be dramatically lower than in the other examined geographies.

- Average household size in all three geographies has declined by just under 1% since 2010, now averaging 2.16 persons in the BOA, 2.49 in the SW Planning District, and 2.28 in the city. This trend is expected to continue with a decline of less than 1% by 2021.
- Median age of residents is similar in all three geographies: 31.3 years in the BOA, 29.6 in the SW Planning District, and 31.8 in the city overall. Only the BOA is expected to experience a decrease in median age by 2021, to 30.1, while the SW Planning District's will rise to 30.4 years and the city's to 32.5 years.
- BOA residents are more likely to be people of color - 80.7% identify as African-American or Black, compared with 64.1% in the SW Planning District and 42.2% citywide.
- BOA residents are more likely to be families with children, with 62.5% of residents living in family households, compared with 56.7% in the SW Planning District and 49.8% in the city overall. Housing planning for the BOA should take into consideration the needs of families to have critical services available nearby¹:
 - Families with children may need more space than other households, and as a result may prefer single family homes but, because of the costs of raising children, be poorly positioned to purchase;
 - Working parents require schools and childcare, and for parents with service-oriented jobs childcare may extend to non-traditional hours to accommodate evening/night or rotating shift schedules;
 - Working parents require reliable transportation that enables them to travel among home, childcare/school, doctors' offices, and work, often on short notice. Bus stops in and near the BOA are an advantage and the possibility of alternate transportation methods^{2,3} may be another positive for a neighborhood that may not have high levels of vehicle ownership.

Housing Market Highlights

- Demographic changes will affect housing demand – housing for families will be in higher demand in the BOA, as will residences that can accommodate aging adults.
- The housing stock is aging – 50% of homes in the City of Rochester were built in 1939 or earlier; the Vacuum Oil BOA and SW Planning District nearly match the citywide median, with 50% built during or before 1940.
- A majority of residents are renters in all three geographies but the Vacuum Oil BOA has an especially high rate: 70% in the Vacuum Oil BOA, 54% in the SW Planning District, and 57% citywide. Renting is expected to increase as a housing choice compared to owning, across all geographies.
- The median value of an owner-occupied home in the City of Rochester is \$80,762, but within the Vacuum Oil BOA approximately 40% of owner-occupied homes are valued at \$50,000 or less.

¹ *Childcare and Sustainable Community Development*, American Planning Association, 2011.

<https://www.planning.org/research/family/briefingpapers/childcare.htm>

² *Uber Picks up Support from Black Clergy*, Albany Times Union, 11/25/16. <http://www.timesunion.com/local/article/Uber-picks-up-support-from-black-clergy-10636918.php>

³ *Mayor Warren and Others Fight to Get Uber Approved in NYS*, RochesterFirst.com, 11/9/15. <http://www.rochesterfirst.com/news/local-news/mayor-warren-and-others-fight-to-get-uber-approved-in-nys>

- Demand for affordability programs for both owners and renters is high and will continue to be high, as median income is not expected to grow:
 - By 2021, the greatest number of new housing units expected to be needed is for households in the \$25,000 - \$34,999 income range; 68 new in the BOA, 885 new in the SW Planning District, and 4,265 new citywide.
 - Most households citywide, but especially in the Vacuum Oil BOA, qualify as Low Income or Very Low Income by HUD standards.
 - 64% of BOA households currently pay more than 50% of their income in rent, exceeding the HUD standard of cost burdened households, which is paying 30% of income in rent.
- Home ownership affordability programs largely focus on acquisition, though some are designed to support residents' need to repair (for example, roofing assistance). Other weaknesses include restrictions on reselling renovated homes and minimum post-renovation values, which may be burdensome on households who need the ability to move for employment opportunities but cannot sell their home. They also often assume the buyer has access to banking services; redevelopment that supports home ownership should consider the proximity of banks.

Home Builder Snapshot

The Rochester Home Builders Association publishes a list of more than 60 members who build homes in the city and region. Many builders provide information through their web sites. To provide an overview of the costs of newly built single family homes, a web search was conducted to gather information about each builder: type of home, communities, dollar cost per square foot, average or typical home size, and average or typical home price. This is not a statistically rigorous technique, but the information published by the builders is informative. It indicates that the majority of the builders work mostly in the suburbs and that new single family homes tend to cost at least \$250,000. Urban infill at lower price points is likely to be a challenge for many builders who most commonly build on greenfield sites in the suburbs, not just because they may typically charge higher costs per square foot but because they may be less familiar with implementing urban construction projects. Partnering with a developer or builder who appreciates the challenges of urban construction may be an important success factor. The table at right summarizes some key statistics.

Home Builders in Rochester, Sample Statistics	
Measurement	Value
Number of Builders Pricing at \$155,000 or Less	5
Median Dollar Cost per SF	\$166
Average Dollar Cost per SF	\$159
Low Dollar Cost per SF	\$84
High Dollar Cost per SF	\$227
Low Cost for Completed Home	\$143,000
High Cost for Completed Home	\$950,000

Market-Feasible Housing

Housing Demand by Income Range

This section of the analysis estimates price points where there is not currently sufficient housing to meet demand. It focuses on the likely market for single family homes for ownership or for rent, in keeping with the current housing mix, the current zoning, and the city's desire to increase home ownership.

To simplify the presentation, single family homes with a value up to \$149,000 or a rent up to \$1,499 are considered. **Demand for housing at higher price points is minimal, particularly in the BOA. Demand for housing at lower costs, particularly subsidized rental opportunities, is very strong.** Residents are likely to participate in housing

assistance programs that support a household’s ability to afford market rate housing, for example home ownership programs.

Estimating Demand – Method of Calculation

Demand for housing is estimated using Median Household Income (MHI), the housing cost affordability measures of Price-to-Income (PTI) and Cost Burden, and the number of units – single family homes or rentals – at different price points.

- MHI is from the ESRI database, which uses U.S. Census/ACH Housing Survey data and income brackets -- \$15,000 - \$24,999 and \$25,000 - \$34,999, with the number of households estimated in each range. A table showing these ranges is presented below.
- Average PTI for the City of Rochester was calculated in the *Housing Analysis* report at 2.6, meaning that a household earning X would be considered able to afford a home valued at 2.6X.
- “Cost Burdened” refers to households that pay more than 30% of income in housing costs. If a household earns \$25,000 per year, 30% of income would be \$7,500 per year or \$625 per month and housing costs above those levels would deem the household cost burdened.
- Price points for owner-occupied housing are from ESRI, which calculates broad categories. The following are likely to be demanded, given the demographics of the city and the BOA: under \$50,000, \$50,000 - \$99,999, and \$100,000 - \$149,999. Additional categories at higher prices are not included in this analysis.
- Price points for rental housing are from ESRI, which includes rent categories mostly in \$50 - \$100 increments such as \$500 - \$549, \$800 - \$899, etc. These price points were consolidated for the *Housing Analysis* into increments of \$100 for most categories. Details of these price points is presented in a table below.

MHI Brackets from Housing Analysis Report			
Household Income Range	City of Rochester Households	SW Planning Households	BOA Households
<\$15,000	23,397	4,452	359
\$15,000 - \$24,999	12,763	2,499	127
\$25,000 - \$34,999	11,480	2,322	96
\$35,000 - \$49,999	12,361	2,451	134
\$50,000 - \$74,999	12,686	2,349	80
\$75,000 - \$99,999	6,785	1,086	29
\$100,000 - \$149,999	5,189	690	4
\$150,000 - \$199,999	1,629	173	1
\$200,000+	1,347	143	3

Estimating demand at different price points required matching a household’s ability to pay (MHI bracket) with the housing cost by category.

For owner-occupied housing, two of the three house value categories were affordable by two income brackets and therefore the income brackets are consolidated into one for a better match with housing value data. For rental units, most income brackets were broad enough to afford more than one monthly rent category, so

Source: ESRI
 create rental costs that better matched MHI brackets.

rent categories were consolidated to

The price point analyses each include three cost categories, either for home value or monthly rent, and these are correlated with resident MHI brackets to estimate the demand for each housing cost category.

Owner-Occupied Housing Demand

The demand for owner-occupied housing is estimated for each of the three geographies, since new or renovated housing in the neighborhood is likely to attract residents from across the city. The tables below present an analysis

of “Net Housing Supply (gap)” based on current household incomes, home values, and the affordability of those homes at household incomes. Current general rates of home ownership are used to calculate the approximate number of households that wish to own; citywide and in the SW Planning District approximately 50% of households own their homes, while in the BOA it is closer to 30% or fewer. The number of households expected to demand owner-occupied housing is subtracted from the number of current units at each of three price categories to determine whether there is adequate to excess supply (more current units than households demanding them) or a gap (fewer current units than households demanding them.)

In the City of Rochester, there is a net housing gap, meaning not enough units, for home values below \$50,000 and in the \$100,000 - \$149,999 price range. There is an oversupply of homes in the \$50,000 to \$99,999 range, not surprising with the median home value in that range and relatively little new construction, as noted in the *Housing Analysis*. The SW Planning District shows the same pattern, with gaps at the lower and mid-to-higher ranges and an oversupply in the mid-range of values. It is interesting that the number of households in each category is roughly the same, so the gaps and oversupply are not a result of a large group of households in one income bracket, but a too-low number of units. The difference in units at the price ranges is visible in the second column, “# Current Units” and shows a much greater supply in the mid-range home values.

The Vacuum Oil BOA shows a similar pattern of gaps in the lower and mid-to-higher range, even though the units are relatively more concentrated in the lower range. There are only 8 units valued in the \$100,000 - \$149,999 range but even at a low 25% ownership rate, 54 households could demand housing in that price range.

Since this report studies market rate housing feasibility, the key demand sector will be in the \$100,000 - \$149,000 home value range, where the demand analysis shows substantial supply gaps across all geographies, including in the BOA itself despite demand having been adjusted downward based on current rates of ownership. If home ownership demand increases, potentially with more attractive options known to be planned, the gap may rise from 46 units of unmet demand to 92 units of unmet demand.

This may be a small number of units demanded for the city overall, but to put it in perspective, the Site #14 neighborhood currently has 44 single family homes. With a 25% home ownership rate there are 46 BOA households with an income that may lead them to want an owner-occupied home in this price range, but there aren’t enough homes available. An increase in demand to 92 households would mean that there are 92 households that may want a home in the \$100,000 - \$149,000 price range, but only 8 homes in the neighborhood, or nearly 12 potential buyers for each home.

The demand analysis indicates households are likely to purchase homes in the \$100,000 - \$149,000 range. For a 1,600 SF home that would be a cost of \$62.50 to \$93.75 per SF for each home.

City of Rochester - Existing Supply of Owner-Occupied Homes by Value up to \$149,999

Range of Home Value	# Current Units	Low End of Income Range	High End of Income Range	Income Range if PTI is 2.6	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Owner-occupied at 50%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
<\$50,000	6,549	\$13,462	\$19,231	<\$15,000	23,397	11,699	(5,150)
\$50,000-\$99,999	14,570	\$19,231	\$38,461	15,000 - \$34,999	24,243	12,122	2,449
\$100,000-\$149,999	4,530	\$38,462	\$57,692	35,000 - \$74,999	25,047	12,524	(7,994)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

SW Planning District - Existing Supply of Owner-Occupied Homes by Value up to \$149,999

Range of Home Value	# Current Units	Low End of Income Range	High End of Income Range	Income Range if PTI is 2.6	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Owner-occupied at 50%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
<\$50,000	1,302	\$13,462	\$19,231	<\$15,000	4,452	2,226	(924)
\$50,000-\$99,999	3,492	\$19,231	\$38,461	15,000 - \$34,999	4,821	2,411	1,082
\$100,000-\$149,999	802	\$38,462	\$57,692	35,000 - \$74,999	4,800	2,400	(1,598)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

Vacuum Oil BOA - Existing Supply of Owner-Occupied Homes by Value up to \$149,999

Range of Home Value	# Current Units	Low End of Income Range	High End of Income Range	Income Range if PTI is 2.6	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Owner-occupied at 25%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
<\$50,000	62	\$13,462	\$19,231	<\$15,000	359	90	(28)
\$50,000-\$99,999	57	\$19,231	\$38,461	15,000 - \$34,999	223	56	1
\$100,000-\$149,999	8	\$38,462	\$57,692	35,000 - \$74,999	214	54	(46)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

Renter-occupied Housing Demand

The rental market in all three geographies is studied in the tables below, with monthly rent matched to income range and the number of households in that range.

A note on the data – the number of units in each monthly rent range is supplied by the database provider ESRI, which derives much of its raw data from the U.S. Census Bureau. In a small sample, such as the SW Planning District and the Vacuum Oil BOA, data can be less precise as a result of misreporting, underreporting, or changes in rent from year to year. However, the general trends that emerge are more reliable, particularly when the trend, such as oversupply of units at the lowest rent, appears in all geographies. The trends in the rental analysis all show excess demand for units at the higher rent cost of \$1,250 - \$1,499, a range where there are few units available. This is also consistent with the trend in the downtown area of developers to build and find occupants for higher-end rentals.

In all geographies, rental units in the lowest price range of \$500 - \$799/month exceed households likely to rent them if the decision is based solely on the ability to afford the rent. Citywide, 24,293 households have incomes between \$15,000 and \$34,999, which would make rent payments at or below \$799 affordable. There are an estimated 29,914 units in this price range, more than there are households in the predicted income range, and many more than would be predicted if half the households chose to own instead. Therefore, the prediction that households rent only where they can best afford it is likely

Renter-Occupied Housing Units by Contract Rent Cost, Monthly			
Monthly Rent Payment	City of Rochester	SW Planning District	Vacuum Oil BOA
No cash rent	823	234	5
<\$500	12,604	2,096	181
\$500-599	9,758	1,698	99
\$600-\$699	11,407	2,297	78
\$700-\$799	8,749	1,594	112
\$800-\$899	4,367	741	11
\$900-\$999	1,929	391	11
\$1,000-1,249	1,921	301	23
\$1,250-\$1,499	838	131	17
\$1,500+	787	163	4
Total	53,183	9,646	541

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

wrong. The city has a low 3.4% vacancy rate among multifamily units. It is therefore likely that the lower cost rental units are being occupied by households that could theoretically afford to pay more of their household income in

rent but either choose not to, or cannot find rental units attractive enough to move “up” a level in cost. New units are being constructed downtown at the highest rent level, but these are not yet fully integrated into the data and the number of new units is still insufficient to satisfy all of the predicted demand.

The same pattern appears to be evident for rentals in the \$800 - \$1,249/month range, although to a lesser degree. Citywide, 8,217 units rent at that rate, but only 12,361 households are in the income range that would predict that rent level, and with only half of them renting, or 6,181, it is estimated that there is an excess of 2,037 units.

The top rent rate for this analysis, \$1,250 - \$1,499, is the only category that shows a supply gap citywide, with 6,343 households predicted to demand units at that cost but only 838 units available. It is therefore likely that this group, and the income brackets below it, each actually select rental housing at a cost level below what they could afford. This may be thrift, but it is also likely to be in part because of lack of supply.

The SW Planning District shows a similar pattern of excess supply, compared with predicted demand, at the lower rent levels and excess demand in the rent range of \$1,250 - \$1,499.

The Vacuum Oil BOA, on the other hand, has excess supply at the \$500 - \$799 level, but excess demand in the two higher cost categories. There are approximately 45 rental units renting for \$800 - \$1,249/month but 101 households in the \$35,000 - \$49,999 income range, which would be predicted to demand rental properties at that price point. A smaller number of households earn between \$50,000 and \$74,999 per year, but as with the owner-occupied homes, there is not enough supply at that price point, for a gap of 43 units. As noted above, this is a small sample and reporting errors would have an outsize effect on the data. However, even if the rental gap is estimated at a lower 30 units, there would be approximately 60 households desiring that housing, or 2 for each unit. With only 55 parcels in the Site #14 neighborhood, 30 units is a significant level of demand.

City of Rochester - Existing Supply of Rental Units

Monthly Rent Payment	# Current Units	Income Range	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Rent at 50%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
\$500-\$799	29,914	\$15,000 - \$34,999	24,243	12,122	17,793
\$800-\$1,249	8,217	\$35,000 - \$49,999	12,361	6,181	2,037
\$1,250-\$1,499	838	\$50,000 - \$74,999	12,686	6,343	(5,505)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

SW Planning District - Existing Supply of Rental Units

Monthly Rent Payment	# Current Units	Income Range	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Rent at 50%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
\$500-\$799	5,589	\$15,000 - \$34,999	4,821	2,411	3,179
\$800-\$1,249	1,433	\$35,000 - \$49,999	2,451	1,226	208
\$1,250-\$1,499	131	\$50,000 - \$74,999	2,349	1,175	(1,044)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

Vacuum Oil BOA - Existing Supply of Rental Units

Monthly Rent Payment	# Current Units	Income Range	Number of Households in Income Range	Households Demanding Rent at 75%	Net Housing Supply (gap)
\$500-\$799	289	\$15,000 - \$34,999	223	167	122
\$800-\$1,249	45	\$35,000 - \$49,999	134	101	(56)
\$1,250-\$1,499	17	\$50,000 - \$74,999	80	60	(43)

Source: ESRI, Camoin Associates

Redevelopment of Site #5

Introduction

Camoin Associates was asked to prepare a market-based redevelopment concept for housing on a group of residential streets within the southeast corner of the BOA, identified as Site #5 on the Vacuum Oil Brownfield Opportunity Area 2035 Vision Plan. The parcels line Luther Circle and would offer potential to update one of the main gateways to the community. The properties currently on these parcels are owned and operated by the Rochester Housing Authority, however the Authority's plan for the property is unknown at this time.



The following is a summary of the parcels with two redevelopment scenarios, including one with the Rochester Housing Authority acting as the sole redeveloper of the site and another with an assumption that the site transitions to the private sector and the units become market-rate housing.

Site Assessment

The site assessment incorporates sections on Neighborhood Definition and Site Location, Housing Types and Tenure, and Zoning. It provides both background and detail on aspects of the neighborhood proposed to be redeveloped.

Neighborhood Definition and Site Location

Located in the southeast corner of the BOA, the Site runs along Luther Circle, directly off of Plymouth Avenue, around the cul-de-sac. While it is not located on the river, the property is in close proximity to the Genesee River and the Genesee Riverway Trail. The units are adjacent to the Riverview Apartments which were built in 2008 and are market rate units that are more modern looking.

Housing Types and Tenure

The buildings in the Site #5 neighborhood are generally large two story apartment buildings built in the 1970s and are owned and managed by the Rochester Housing Authority. There are a few residential units that are along Plymouth Avenue that were originally built in 1920s that are privately owned two family residential units. There are no records of code violations for these properties. Combined, the seven parcels are assessed at \$1,167,400.⁴



⁴ Photo and information source: City of Rochester Assessment Website

Amenities

While not included in the Site #5 definition, the units are within walking distance to Deli Sandros, a neighborhood deli.

Transportation

The neighborhood is located directly off of Plymouth Avenue, offering transportation options including by car and bus. There are two close bus stations including at Plymouth & Cottage and Plymouth & Jefferson. Both stations offer access to the Route 19 bus the 45-48x/4x. Bus route 19 has service at intervals between 15 and 30 minutes depending on the time of day, with stops at the University of Rochester, Strong Memorial Hospital, and the downtown Transit Center, among other destinations.⁵



Zoning

The neighborhood to be redeveloped is zoned R-1, Low-Density Residential District. Single family homes, attached with a shared interior wall or detached, are the most common form of low-density housing in the neighborhood. According to the city's code, "The district requirements are intended to preserve and promote neighborhoods characterized by unobstructed front yards and pedestrian-scale streetscapes and to protect against undesirable uses and residential conversions." The city has expressed the intent to retain R-1 zoning in this neighborhood.

In addition to attached and detached single family homes, R-1 allows compatible uses including day-care centers, an amenity that is likely to be demanded in a neighborhood with a higher percentage of families than the city overall. This use may be attractive as other zoning nearby allows for uses not necessarily desirably or compatible with childcare facilities, such as distribution centers or entertainment. Some zoning uses are prohibited from within 1,000 feet of a day-care facility, and vice versa. Redevelopment planning for Site #14 can provide an opportunity to identify parcels within the neighborhood that will be more than 1,000 feet from other zoning, avoiding potential conflicts as development occurs throughout the BOA.

Office uses are allowed "when in an existing structure built for nonresidential use, operating between the hours of 6:00am and 9:00 pm." Unless an existing non-residential structure is available for renovation or rehabilitation, a bank would not be able to locate in this neighborhood without a zoning variance. However, immediately to the southwest and within walking distance, there is an M-1 overlay district, in which industry is encouraged to use existing older two-story and multistory buildings. This district may be a suitable site for a bank that serves area residents.

Redevelopment Concept Implementation

1) The first scenario is based on the assumption that the Rochester Housing Authority is interested in maintaining ownership and operation of the parcels. The RHA was contacted during this study but could not be reached for feedback; however, we assume that they would like to maintain the property as part of their portfolio and are interested in making improvements to the property. The following are a number of projects, partnerships, and policies that could improve the residential units along Luther Circle.

⁵ Bus stop map and information provided by Google

- Keep the lines of communication open with the Rochester Housing Authority to identify areas where they may need assistance and how the City and other partner organizations can cooperate to serve the residents. Hold regular sit-down meetings to discuss properties and areas for coordination and partnerships.
- Continue to provide funding to connect the Luther Circle properties (and the Riverview Apartments) with neighborhood amenities. Connect with the waterfront, retail services, human services, and others as possible. Connections include by public transportation, private car, bicycles and foot.
- Work with neighborhood residents to understand their needs and desires for improvements or additional services. Coordinate with the RHA to identify how to meet those needs and potential partnerships.
- Work to develop services along Plymouth Avenue to serve the residents. Consider development opportunities in the Cottage/Jefferson/Plymouth triangle to serve residents in the southern portion of the BOA, including the residents at the Riverview Apartments.

2) The second scenario assumes that there is a desire on the part of the Rochester Housing Authority to transfer ownership to a private entity (possibly with some public assistance) to develop mixed-income housing, including market rate units. Note that demand for affordable housing remains strong so complete elimination of affordable units would likely not be the best approach for the BOA neighborhood. The following is an implementation plan for moving this idea forward.

- Work directly with the Rochester Housing Authority and associated partners to understand financial implications and sales values. Understand their current tenants and potential options for relocation should the property be redeveloped as market rate.
- Establish ownership for the parcels to allow for issuance of a request for proposals from potential developers.
- Once market rate and sale values are established, conduct a generic pro forma analysis and issue a request for developers to complete the project. Indicate desire for market rate units and/or mixed-income. Request financial information on the developer, funding scenarios, and examples of previous work.
- Review the proposals submitted and determine whether the redevelopment scenario meets the City's needs and move forward with applicable contracts and related transactions.

Housing Visions

Another option for the City of Rochester to consider is partnering with an organization named Housing Visions. This is a not-for-profit organization that provides neighborhood revitalization solutions through development, construction, property management, and visions for change. Established over twenty years ago, Housing Visions first started in Syracuse and has since worked throughout New York State provide safe and secure housing for low to moderate income individuals. They have the capacity and experience to find financing solutions to highly complex projects. Housing Visions would be able to help from start to finish to create a new residential product for the neighborhood.

With demand for affordable units being so high in the city and the BOA, this approach might allow for improvements to the units while still being accessible to the area's residents.

Camoin Associates, Inc.
120 West Avenue, Suite 303
Saratoga Springs, NY 12866
518.899.2608
www.camoinassociates.com
@camoinassociate

