

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 4, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-010-11-12 Modify rear addition	7 S. Madison Park	Type II				X		0-6-0
A-013-11-12 Telecom panels	615 University Avenue	Type II		X				0-6-0
A-023-11-12 Replace sidewalks	2-60 Grove St. 100 Gibbs St.	Type II					X	6-0-0
A-024-11-12 Legalize signage	367 Park Avenue	Type II	X			X <sup>1</sup>		5-1-0 ground sign 2-4-0 wall sign
A-025-11-12 Replace retaining wall	37-41 Atkinson Street	Type II						Postponed by applicant
A-026-11-12 Modify previously approved design of 5 townhouses	109-123 University Ave.	Type II	X <sup>2</sup>			X <sup>3</sup>		6-0-0 five changes noted below; 3-3-0 two changes noted below

Michael Warfield Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Mimi Tilton Present  
Bruce McLearn Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Deborah Beardslee Absent

g:\planning&zoning\bldgzng\zoning\rpb\2012 rpb\grid\january4, 2012rpbgrid.doc

<sup>1</sup> The ground sign in the front yard was approved; the wall sign was denied, and the applicant was asked to return with a proposal more in keeping with the character of Park Avenue.

<sup>2</sup> Approved: 1)phase construction of three units followed by two; 2)simplify porch railings; 3)add porches at garden court; 4)replace brick on garden court walls with cement board siding; and 5)delete fences at garden court, reduce size of patios.

<sup>3</sup> Held: 1)eliminate window muntins; 2)replace brick on tower walls with cement board siding.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 1, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-013-11-12 Telecom panels	615 University Avenue	Type II						6-0-0 <sup>1</sup>
A-024-11-12 Legalize signage	367 Park Avenue	Type II				X		Postponed to March hearing
A-026-11-12 Modify gatehouse of townhouses	109-123 University Avenue	Type I	X					6-0-0
A-027-11-12 Fencing	14 Selden Street	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			6-0-0
A-028-11-12 Signage	647 Park Avenue	Type II				X		Postponed to March hearing
A-034-10-11 Modify design of multifamily housing	33 Litchfield Street	Type I	X <sup>3</sup>			X		6-0-0 Building and site 4-2-0 Hold on trash enclosure

Michael Warfield Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Mimi Tilton Present  
Bruce McLear Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present  
Bonny Mayer Absent

g:\planning&zoning\bldgzng\zoning\rpb\2012 rpb\grid\february1, 2012rpbgrid.doc

<sup>1</sup> The Board determined that the revised application is materially different from the prior application and may be submitted for review at the March hearing of the Board.

<sup>2</sup> The Board approved a 6'H fence in lieu of the taller fence requested, and suggested the height be reviewed once the neighboring townhouses are constructed.

<sup>3</sup> The Board approved the revisions to the building and site plan but held on approval of the trash enclosure due to neighborhood concerns.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, MARCH 7, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-034-10-11 Modify design of multifamily housing	33 Litchfield Street	Type I			X <sup>1</sup>			5-0-1 Trash enclosure and landscaping
A-013-11-12 Telecom panels	615 University Avenue	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			5-1-0
A-024-11-12 Legalize signage	367 Park Avenue	Type II				X		Applicant did not attend
A-028-11-12 Signage	647 Park Avenue	Type II	X <sup>3</sup>					4-2-0
A-029-11-12	75 Douglas Road	Type II	X					6-0-0
A-030-11-12	25 N. Goodman Street	Type II	X					6-0-0
A-031-11-12	546 East Avenue	Type I						Comments only
A-032-11-12	820 East Avenue	Type II		X <sup>4</sup>				2-4-0
A-003-10-11	16 East Blvd.	Type I	X					6-0-0
Landmark nomination	13 Cataract Street							Board will sponsor

Michael Warfield Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Mimi Tilton Present  
Bruce McLear Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Paul McAndrew Absent

g:\planning&zoning\bldgzng\zoning\rpb\2012 rpb\grid\march 7, 2012rpbgrid.doc

<sup>1</sup> Conditions: Building operator to control trash area and pick-up protocol to protect neighbors from odors, noise and rodents.

<sup>2</sup> Conditions: Paint cables to blend with building; review technology every 2 years to see if less-intrusive antennae are available.

<sup>3</sup> Recommendation: Paint cornice to change color from dark brown to a lighter color.

<sup>4</sup> Board members found that the columns were too massive for the character of the building.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, APRIL 4, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-010-11-12	7 South Madison Park	Type II	X					5-0-0
A-012-11-12	32 Oliver Street	Type II					X	5-0-1 (Schick recused)
A-031-11-12	546 East Avenue	Type I			X <sup>1</sup>	X <sup>2</sup>		Stone: 6-0-0 Subcommittee: 6-0-0
A-033-11-12	29 Portsmouth Terrace	Type II			X <sup>3</sup>			5-0-0
A-034-11-12	1468 East Avenue	Type II	X					5-0-0
A-035-11-12	1434 East Avenue	Type II	X					5-0-0
A-036-11-12	43 Vick Park A	Type II			X <sup>4</sup>			6-0-0
A-037-11-12	47 Vick Park A	Type II			X <sup>5</sup>			6-0-0
A-038-11-12	49 Vick Park A	Type II			X <sup>6</sup>			6-0-0
A-039-11-12	77 Atkinson St.	Type II			X <sup>7</sup>			6-0-0
L-001-11-12	13 Cataract Street	Type II						6-0-0 <sup>8</sup>

Michael Warfield Present (tardy for 4 cases)  
Jon Schick Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Bruce McLearn Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Mimi Tilton Absent

<sup>1</sup> Stone veneer approved on condition that it is installed in a manner that minimizes variations between thicknesses in order to present as smooth a surface as possible.

<sup>2</sup> A 3-member subcommittee was empowered to review landscaping at the East Avenue side and at the new northwest entry, and the infilling of the ramp along the west side and installation of associated landscaping.

<sup>3</sup> Conditions of approval: Use Andersen 400 series windows and doors w/a muntin configuration to match existing. Consult w/City staff on design of egress windows.

<sup>4</sup> Conditions of approval: Replace the 2 vinyl windows with new windows of wood, fiberglass or aluminum-clad wood.

<sup>5</sup> Conditions of approval: Replace the 7 vinyl windows with new windows of wood, fiberglass or aluminum-clad wood. Shutters do not need to be reinstalled.

<sup>6</sup> Conditions of approval: Replace the 9 vinyl windows with new windows of wood, fiberglass or aluminum-clad wood. Shutters do not need to be reinstalled.

<sup>7</sup> Conditions of approval: Porch to be a single level, 14' deep; railings, posts and trim to match existing house.

<sup>8</sup> The Board determined that the property holds a significant, iconic structure in a distinctive location on the gorge, designed by noted brewery architect A. C. Wagner in the style of late 19<sup>th</sup> century Romanesque Revival, with rich, irreplaceable masonry detailing. It is the only remaining brewery building of its era in Rochester. The building was determined by the State Historic Preservation Officer to be eligible for listing in the State and National Registers of Historic Places.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, MAY 2, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-031-11-12	546 East Avenue	Type I	X <sup>1</sup>	X <sup>2</sup>	X <sup>3</sup>		X <sup>4</sup>	Overall design: 7-0-0 Switchgear canopy: 0-7-0 Eastside terrace: 7-0-0 Westside stairwell: 7-0-0
A-012-11-12	32 Oliver Street	Type II	X					6-0-1 Schick recused
A-040-11-12	6 Sibley Place	Type II						Comments only
A-041-11-12	1321 University Avenue	Type II					X <sup>5</sup>	6-1-0
A-042-11-12	50 Colby St.	Type II					X <sup>6</sup>	7-0-0
A-043-11-12	6 Madison St.	Type II			X <sup>7</sup>			7-0-0
A-045-11-12	34 King St.	Type II			X <sup>8</sup>	X <sup>9</sup>		6-0-1 conditions 6-0-1 parking pad, garage
A-046-11-12	1185 University Avenue	Type II			X <sup>10</sup>			7-0-0
A-047-11-12	16 Granger Place	Type II			X <sup>11</sup>			7-0-0
A-048-11-12	12 Arnold Park	Type II	X					6-0-1
A-049-11-12	703 Park Avenue	Type II			X <sup>12</sup>			7-0-0
A-050-11-12	365 East Avenue	Type II			X <sup>13</sup>			7-0-0

Michael Warfield Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Bruce McLear Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Mimi Tilton Present

<sup>1</sup> Approved: Northwest vestibule (except upper windows), east entry and drop-off, parking lot, monument sign, trellis, perimeter wall/fence, rooftop conference room.

<sup>2</sup> Fabric canopy over electrical switchgear is not appropriate for the historic visual character of the district.

<sup>3</sup> East side terrace approved on condition that perimeter wall is <54" above the terrace floor, and that the television is eliminated.

<sup>4</sup> West side stair enclosure to have windows placed in a band similar to those on northside penthouse.

<sup>5</sup> Conceptually approved location, mass and materials of additions; blank walls need to be revised.

<sup>6</sup> Recommendations: Diminish apparent length of addition, perhaps by extending main roof over addition; need add'l. details.

---

<sup>7</sup> Conditions: wood railings, ½ round gutters, 5/4 T&G fir decking, Marvin or Kolbe 1-over-1 windows, 2-lite/4-panel door at south, 1-lite 2 panel door at front, restore north chimney and remove other two.

<sup>8</sup> Conditions: rear porch max 7'D x 10'W, retain or replicate window and porch details, restore brick chimney but remove others, find historic photos to help select doors and windows.

<sup>9</sup> Applicant to return with design of storage shed, parking pad, and sidewalk.

<sup>10</sup> Conditions: At west entry, lettering to be 8-10" high; at ATMs, use single-line format and reduce size of logo; on monument sign, reduce size of logo by matching margins on lower portion.

<sup>11</sup> Conditions: Install 6' wood fence only along east side of property, held back ~12" from line; along University Avenue, remove 4' strip of asphalt and plant privet hedge.

<sup>12</sup> Conditions: Awning frames not to be attached to storefront frames, bottom of awnings to be >8' over sidewalk, sides of awnings to be open not closed, no lettering is approved, right-of-way permits needed.

<sup>13</sup> Conditions: Remove wording on lower banners on two flanking windows; at rear entrance reduce logo by 10% and eliminate wording in lower banner.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, June 6, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-041-11-12	1321 University Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-042-11-12	50 Colby St.	Type II						Withdrawn
A-044-11-12	54-54.5 Madison Street	Type II			X <sup>1</sup>			7-0-0
A-045-11-12	34 King St.	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			6-0-1
A-051-11-12	215 Oxford St.	Type II			X <sup>3</sup>			6-1-0
A-052-11-12	42 Vick Park B	Type II		X <sup>4</sup>				0-7-0
A-053-11-12	293 Alexander Street	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-054-11-12	693 East Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-055-11-12	55 Brunswick Street	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-056-11-12	729 Park Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-057-11-12	1479 East Avenue	Type II	X					6-0-1

Michael Warfield Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Bruce McLearn Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Mimi Tilton Present

<sup>1</sup> Removal of lead paint to be diligently monitored by City staff to prevent contamination of adjacent properties.

<sup>2</sup> Board authorized Zoning staff to determine need for window muntins and shutters and the style of the front door.

<sup>3</sup> Parking area to be excavated and boxed out, and crushed stone used in lieu of gravel. Garage slab to remain, but applicant intends to remove it in near future and install pavement.

<sup>4</sup> Three windows facing street are to be removed and replaced with new windows as defined in the Board's window policy.

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, July 11, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-026-11-12	109 University Avenue	Type II	X <sup>1</sup>					5-1-0
A-001-12-13	27 Madison Street	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			Windows: 6-0-0 Fence: 6-0-0
A-002-12-13	494 W. Main Street	Type II						Withdrawn
A-003-12-13	25 Vick Park B	Type II					X <sup>3</sup>	6-0-0
A-004-12-13	554 Mt. Hope Avenue	Type II	X					6-0-0
A-005-12-13	39 Colby St.	Type II	X					5-1-0
A-006-12-13	604 Beach Avenue	Type II			X <sup>4</sup>			6-0-0
A-007-12-13	40 Hawthorne Street	Type II					X	5-0-1

Michael Warfield	Present
Jon Schick	Present
Paul McAndrew	Present
Bruce McLearn	Present
Bonny Mayer	Present
Mimi Tilton	Present
Deborah Beardslee	Absent

<sup>1</sup> Eliminate muntins from all windows.

<sup>2</sup> Conditions: fence to be reduced to 7'h max, though it would still need a variance for excess height.

<sup>3</sup> Need details on windows, doors and siding. Staff authorized to review.

<sup>4</sup> Condition: corner column to be thickened to perhaps 10" square



**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-008-12-13	23-25 Park Avenue	Type II	X			X <sup>1</sup>		Fence: 7-0-0 Hold on Porch: 7-0-0
A-009-12-13	603 Park Avenue	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			7-0-0
A-010-12-13	59 Park Avenue	Type II				X <sup>3</sup>		7-0-0
A-011-12-13	5 Portsmouth Terrace	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-012-12-13	26 Rundel Park	Type II	X <sup>4</sup>					7-0-0
A-013-12-13	28 Vick Park B	Type II			X <sup>5</sup>			7-0-0
A-014-12-13	34 Park Avenue	Type II					X <sup>6</sup>	4-3-0
A-015-12-13	54 Park Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-016-12-13	60 Park Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-017-12-13	22 Madison Street	Type II	X					6-1-0
A-018-12-13	45 Exchange Boulevard	Type II	X					6-1-0
A-019-12-13	230 Oxford Street	Type II		X				0-7-0
A-020-12-13	333 Park Avenue	Type II						Postponed to October hearing
A-021-12-13	275 Alexander Street	Type II			X <sup>7</sup>			7-0-0
A-022-12-13	14 Eagle Street	Type II	X					6-0-1

<sup>1</sup> Applicant to return with additional detail of porch spindles, rails and posts.

<sup>2</sup> Studs of wall sign to be inserted into mortar joints between bricks, not into bricks themselves.

<sup>3</sup> Applicant to return with information on location and types of replacement windows.

<sup>4</sup> Owner commits to replacing 4 windows now, 5 more within 2 years, and the remainder within 5 years.

<sup>5</sup> Conditions: porch steps to use historically appropriate 5/4" wood with traditional details; walkway to be smooth, not stamped.

<sup>6</sup> Staff authorized to review porch details; windows approved as installed.

<sup>7</sup> Conditions: thinner metal posts (~2") w/simple finials; reduce lettering size ~10% to eliminate crowding.

Michael Warfield	Present
Jon Schick	Present
Paul McAndrew	Present
Bruce McLearn	Present
Bonny Mayer	Present
Mimi Tilton	Present
Deborah Beardslee	Present

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 10, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-010-12-13	59 Park Avenue	Type II						Withdrawn by applicant
A-020-12-12	333 Park Avenue	Type II			X <sup>1</sup>			7-0-0
A-023-12-13	1442 East Avenue	Type II	X					7-0-0
A-024-12-13	809 East Avenue	Type II			X <sup>2</sup>			5-2-0
A-025-12-13	8 Arnold Park	Type II	X					6-1-0
A-026-12-13	626 Park Avenue	Type II			X <sup>3</sup>			6-1-0
A-027-12-13	839 East Avenue	Type II			X <sup>4</sup>			7-0-0
A-028-12-13	121 Troup Street	Type II			X <sup>5</sup>			6-1-0

<sup>1</sup> Conditions: Upper porch to extend south over lower porch by 2' but should not cantilever on the east or west.

<sup>2</sup> Conditions: Extend pavement another 9' for a total of 80' of parking surface; eliminate fence enclosure; shrubbery needed to screen parking space from East Avenue and is to be presented to the Board at a future hearing.

<sup>3</sup> Condition: sign to be 24"H x 14'L.

<sup>4</sup> Condition: Revisit landscape plan within 2 years to determine whether additional plantings needed where beech tree removed.

<sup>5</sup> Conditions: Driveway limited to 11'w and is to be smooth pavement, not stamped; staff authorized to approve final design.

Michael Warfield	Present
Jon Schick	Present
Paul McAndrew	Present
Bruce McLearn	Present
Bonny Mayer	Present
Mimi Tilton	Present
Deborah Beardslee	Present

**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-024-12-13	809 East Avenue	Type II	X <sup>1</sup>					5-0-0
A-029-12-13	36 Colby Street	Type II		X	X <sup>2</sup>			Shed and fence approved 5-0-0 Removal of chimney denied 1-4-0
A-030-12-13	1049 Park Avenue	Type II		X <sup>3</sup>				0-5-0

Michael Warfield	Present
Jon Schick	Present
Paul McAndrew	Present
Bruce McLear	Present
Bonny Mayer	Present
Mimi Tilton	Absent
Deborah Beardslee	Absent

<sup>1</sup> Approved installation of four Hicks yews along east side of new parking space.

<sup>2</sup> Condition of approval: Fence height to align with adjacent fences.

<sup>3</sup> Applicants given a year to gradually replace vinyl windows with appropriate windows.



**ROCHESTER PRESERVATION BOARD  
SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION FOR STATE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY REVIEW ACT  
AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 2012**

**To: Commissioner Carlos Carballada**

Case	Address	SEQR	C of A Granted	C of A Denied	C of A On Condition	Held	Conceptual Approval	Vote(s)
A-031-12-13	510 Beach Avenue	Type II		X				0-7-0
A-032-12-13	32 Rundel Park	Type II	X Skylights, storm windows, stain glass window		X <sup>1</sup> Mudroom window and door		X <sup>2</sup> Porch railing	Skylights: 5-2-0 Stained glass window, storm windows, mudroom, porch railing: 7-0-0
A-033-12-13	39 Vick Park B	Type II		X				1-6-0
A-034-12-13	705 Park Avenue	Type II				X <sup>3</sup>		7-0-0
A-035-12-13	620 Park Avenue	Type II			X <sup>4</sup>			7-0-0
A-036-12-13	14-22 S. Goodman St.	Type II	X					Conceptual: 7-0-0 As presented: 4-3-0

Michael Warfield Present  
Jon Schick Present  
Paul McAndrew Present  
Bruce McLearn Present  
Bonny Mayer Present  
Mimi Tilton Present  
Deborah Beardslee Present

<sup>1</sup> Condition of approval: Board authorized zoning staff to review details of mudroom window, door and stone step.

<sup>2</sup> Conceptual approval of knee railing on porch roof; must return to Board with details.

<sup>3</sup> Applicant informed that detailed drawings are needed for further review.

<sup>4</sup> Conditions of approval: letters to have white caps and returns and white lighting; letter spacing to be adjusted.